

**MINUTES OF THE RESCHEDULED MEETING OF THE
EDINA HERITAGE PRESERVATION BOARD
TUESDAY, JULY 12, 2006, AT 7:00 P.M.
EDINA CITY HALL – COMMUNITY ROOM
4801 WEST 50TH STREET**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairman Bob Kojetin, Chris Rofidal, Lou Blemaster, Karen Ferrara, Arlene Forrest, Laura Benson, Nancy Scherer, and Ian Yue

MEMBERS ABSENT: Marie Thorpe

STAFF PRESENT: Joyce Repya, Associate Planner

OTHERS PRESENT: Robert Vogel, Heritage Preservation Consultant
Jane Lonquist, 4510 Drexel Avenue
Lisa Gervais, 4514 Drexel Avenue
Susan Kliner, 4513 Drexel Avenue

I. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:

Member Rofidal moved for approval of the minutes from the June 13, 2006 meeting. Member Ferrara seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – Country Club District

**H-06-3 4512 Drexel Avenue
Demolish existing detached garage and incorporate an
Attached garage with an addition to the home**

Planner Repya explained that the subject property is located on the west side of the 4500 block of Drexel Avenue. The existing home, constructed in 1925 is of the Mediterranean design style. The request for the Certificate of Appropriateness involves the demolition of an exiting 2-stall detached garage located in the rear yard, 38 feet from the rear lot line, 5 feet from the south lot line, and accessed from a driveway running along the south property line. A new attached 3-stall garage is proposed as part of an addition to the home. The existing driveway is proposed to continue providing access to the new attached garage.

The original plan for remodeling the existing home resulted in a change in the architectural style from Mediterranean to what the owner described as English

Cottage style; replacing the stucco exterior with cedar shake siding, a boulder stone base, added gables and an asphalt shingled roof.

Ms. Repya pointed out that the owner of the property, Scott Busyn with Great Neighborhood Homes Inc. has done a considerable amount of communicating with the neighborhood regarding the proposed changes to the property. A photo rendering of the “finished product” home was installed in the front yard to communicate the changes proposed for the home. As a result of the photo, the City and Mr. Busyn received feedback from numerous neighbors on the block concerned that the new architectural style was not compatible with the homes in the neighborhood.

After reviewing the original plans, City Staff and Heritage Preservation Consultant Robert Vogel determined that the remodeled home as shown would detract from the historical significance of the Country Club District as a cohesive heritage neighborhood. Furthermore, Mr. Vogel observed that he felt the proposed work would have a negative impact upon the historic integrity of the district. Mr. Busyn was informed that for the aforementioned reasons, staff would not recommend approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness request.

On the date the staff reports were to be sent to the Board, Mr. Busyn, taking into consideration the neighborhood's, Staff's and Robert Vogel's concerns, submitted a revised plan for the subject property. In a letter to the Board, Mr. Busyn indicated that based on dialog with the 4500 block of Drexel, the exterior design of the home was revised to make it more traditional and appropriate for the neighborhood. He added that in creating the revised design they made every attempt to follow the guidelines set out in the Country Club District Plan of Treatment.

Mr. Busyn also invited the 4500 block neighbors to view the revised plans prior to the HPB meeting to ensure that the neighbors knew that he was listening and taking their concerns into consideration.+

Addressing the revised plan, Consultant Vogel complimented Mr. Busyn upon his responsiveness and willingness to provide a plan that does a much better job of complimenting the historic character of the neighborhood. Furthermore, unlike the original plan, the revised plan would not detract from the historic value of the neighboring homes. Mr. Vogel added that he would recommend approval of the COA request subject to the revised plans dated July 7, 2006 with the requirement that a plaque with “2006” appear somewhere on the home to define it as a redesigned structure.

Scott and Margaret Busyn of Great Neighborhood Homes, Inc. were present to address the revised plan. Mr. Busyn explained that the subject project at 4512 Drexel Avenue is being constructed as a speculative home. He pointed out that they have successfully purchased, upgraded and sold several homes in the Country Club District and received neighborhood praise for the finished products. Great Neighborhood Homes, Inc. pride themselves in addressing the contemporary

functionality of their homes while at the same time adhering to the Country Club District Plan of Treatment for the historic architectural styles.

When asked why architectural style was changed from Mediterranean to English Cottage, Mr. Busyn explained that his research has proven that currently, the English Cottage style is much more marketable.

Several Board members expressed concern that the architectural style of the home was being changed. Consultant Vogel reminded the Board that although the Heritage Preservation Board encourages consideration of the original architectural style of the home when contemplating alterations or changes, the Plan of Treatment does allow one to change the architectural style of the home as long as the new style is one of the traditional historic architectural styles found in the district.

Discussion ensued regarding the original design of the Country Club District. Consultant Vogel observed that while buyers in the 1920's and 1930's had a choice of seven historic architectural styles to choose from, there was not a grand design to ensure that so many of each style was built on each street. In fact, the market at that time drove the makeup of architectural styles in the neighborhood. English Cottage is the most prevalent style found in the District, making up 32% of the homes, followed by 28% American Colonial Revival and 12% Mediterranean.

Member Benson questioned why the Board was discussing the house when the requested COA is for the demolition of the detached garage. Consultant Vogel explained that while the City Council wanted to provide property owners a certain level of flexibility, the goal of the Plan of Treatment is to preserve the historic integrity of the neighborhood. If when reviewing a request for a COA it is determined that the results of the COA would create a structure that would be incompatible with the historic architectural styles in the neighborhood, it is the responsibility of the Board to address the incompatibilities.

The following neighbors were present to address the revised request:

Jane Lonquist – 4510 Drexel Avenue – northerly neighbor

Ms. Lonquist thanked the Busyn's for their responsiveness to the neighbors concerns and commented that the revised plan was a vast improvement.

Ms. Lonquist stated that she wished the street facade of the home would have been maintained. She also questioned the front facing, 3 stall garage which she felt was too large for the neighborhood and inconsistent with layout of the historic homes in the neighborhood.

Lisa Gervais – 4514 Drexel Avenue – southerly neighbor

Ms. Gervais expressed her appreciation to the HPB and the Busyn's for having an opportunity to weigh in on the proposed project. While Ms. Gervais agreed that the revised plan was a big improvement, she was concerned about the change in the architectural style. Specifically, she felt their block of Drexel Avenue was a more formal street where the neighbors have all worked very hard when making changes to their homes to maintain the original styles where the garages are not visible from the front street.

Ms. Gervais added that she liked the requirement that a year built plaque be included in the plan; and wanted to bring to the attention of the Board that there are two healthy elms on the property which she would like assurance would be protected.

Susan Kliner – 4513 Drexel Avenue – across the street

Ms. Kliner thanked the Busyn's for listening to the concerns of the neighborhood and coming up with a plan that is a much better fit.

Planner Repya observed that she received a phone call from Abbie Thiss, 4518 Drexel Avenue who was unable to attend the meeting, however wanted the Board to know that she and her husband were concerned that the original plan was not compatible with the homes in the neighborhood. She expressed her appreciation to the Busyn's for their desire to address the neighbors concerns with open communication. She added that both she and her husband supported the revised plan.

Board members thanked the neighbors for coming to the meeting and sharing their concerns; stressing that it is important for the neighborhood to be a part of the process.

Addressing the revised plan, Member Rofidal stated that he visited the property, and feels the revised plan is much improved; however struggles somewhat with the location of the attached garage which will be closer to the street than the existing detached garage.

Mr. Busyn explained that because a 25 foot rear yard is required for attached garages, the design required the garage to be placed 5 feet closer to the street than the detached garage.

Ms. Gervais, questioned the need for a third stall on the garage. She added that she would prefer the third stall be removed to reduce the length of the building abutting her property to the south.

Member Forrest observed that she understands the need for the third stall in this day and age. Most families utilize the third stall for storage of bikes, lawnmowers and outdoor equipment which might otherwise be stored in the back yard.

Member Scherer stated that she felt the revised plan was a vast improvement over the original plan. She pointed out that when she visited the site, she noticed that many of the surrounding homes have had large additions which have caused rather long building walls on those homes. It appears that when additions are added to these historic homes, longer building walls result. Ms. Scherer questioned the pergola shown on the second floor deck area. Mr. Busyn explained that usually pergolas are found on the first floor, as seen on the house to the south; however they are not uncommon in the District.

Member Blemaster pointed out that as a realtor she sees the changes occurring in the District as a positive for preserving the livability of the homes as well as enhancing the desirability of the neighborhood.

Member Ferrara explained that it is the obligation of the HPB to ensure that the plans approved with requests for Certificates of Appropriateness meet the Plan of Treatment established for the District. She added that the revised plan being considered appears to do just that.

Mr. Busyn advised the Board that when working on homes in the Country Club District it is very important for his company to be considerate of the neighborhood. Perimeter fencing will be installed around the property; the sidewalks will remain open; and special attention will be given to protect the elms on the property. He added that adding a date plaque to the home can also be accomplished.

Following a brief discussion, Member Blemaster moved approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing detached garage and incorporate a new attached garage with an addition to the home subject to the revised plans presented dated July 7, 2006 and the condition that a date built plaque be installed on the building. Member Benson seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

III. FREQUENTLY ASKED QUESTIONS: Continued until the August 8th meeting.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS:

A. 2006 State Historic Preservation Conference – Sept. 28 & 29 in Red Wing

Chairman Kojetin reminded the Board that the State Historic Preservation Conference will be held on Thursday and Friday, September 28 and 29 in Red Wing, Minnesota. Because Edina is a Certified Local Government, we are required to send at least one Board member to at least one day of the conference. Kojetin pointed out that in the

past, members have attended that Friday sessions and found them very beneficial. Planner Repya provided Board members with the registration forms and explained that the City will pay the registration for those wishing to attend. The deadline for registrations will be August 16th, so a final count of those planning on attending will be taken at the August 8th HPB meeting.

B. Paul Peterson House Tour – 5312 Interlachen Boulevard

Planner Repya explained that a tour of the Peterson house has been scheduled for 6:00 p.m. on August 8th, just prior to the regular scheduled meeting on the same date.

V. **NEXT MEETING DATE: August 8, 2006**

VI. **ADJOURNMENT:** 9:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Joyce Repya